

# STATE UNIVERSITIES CIVIL SERVICE SYSTEM

*Sunnycrest Center  
1717 Philo Road, Suite 24  
Urbana, Illinois 61802-6099*



*Joanne E. Maitland  
Merit Board Chair  
Lewis T. (Tom) Morelock  
Executive Director*

August 1, 2011

Dr. William L. Perry  
President  
Eastern Illinois University

Dr. William V. Weber  
Vice President for Business Affairs  
Eastern Illinois University

Ms. Linda C. Holloway  
Interim Director of Human Resources  
Designated Employer Representative  
Eastern Illinois University

Ms. Sherry K. McRaven  
Director of Internal Auditing  
Eastern Illinois University

Mrs. Joanne E. Maitland  
Merit Board Chair  
State Universities Civil Service System

Dr. Robert D. Webb  
Merit Board Member  
State Universities Civil Service System

The State Universities Civil Service System respectfully submits the Final Audit Report of the Biennial Institutional Compliance Audit conducted at Eastern Illinois University. The audit period tested was January 1, 2009 through November 30, 2010. This report is intended to communicate the final material findings, recommendations and corresponding institutional responses formulated through a comprehensive human resource compliance and operational audit.

On behalf of the audit staff, we thank Eastern Illinois University and their human resource staff for a very productive audit experience. If there are any questions or a personal briefing on any item is desired, please call Lucinda M. Neitzel (217) 278-3150 ext. 239.

[REDACTED]

Lewis T. (Tom) Morelock  
Executive Director

---

---

# Eastern Illinois University Final Audit Report

---



## State Universities Civil Service System Compliance Audit

August 1, 2011

Audit Period

January 1, 2009 to November 30, 2010

---

Prepared by:



Lucinda M. Neitzel  
Audit and Advisory Services Manager

**Eastern Illinois University**  
**Final Audit Report**

**Table of Contents**

**Introduction ..... 1**

**Executive Summary ..... 3**

**Material Findings, Recommendations, Institutional Corrective Action Plans and Additional Auditor Comments ..... 4**

**Appendices**

Appendix A: Principal Administrative Appointments Position Descriptions Matching Civil Service Specifications

## Eastern Illinois University **Final Audit Report**

### **Introduction**

#### **PURPOSE**

The State Universities Civil Service System was created as a separate entity of the State of Illinois and is under the control of the University Civil Service Merit Board as set forth in Section 36b(3) of the State Universities Civil Service Act (Act) ([110 ILCS 70/36b\(3\)](#)). The purpose of the State Universities Civil Service System is to establish a sound program of personnel administration for its constituent employers (110 ILCS 70/36b(2)). To achieve this purpose, the Merit Board has been given a broad range of statutory powers and duties, which include the power to make rules to carry out the purpose of the State Universities Civil Service System and to appoint an Executive Director to administer the Act (110 ILCS 70/36d(11) and (12)).

As part of its statutory power, the Merit Board has promulgated rules that delegate to the Executive Director the authority and responsibility for conducting “ongoing audit programs of all Civil Service operations at all places of employment for the purpose of assuring compliance with the [Act (110 ILCS 70/36b et seq.)] and [Part 250 of the Illinois Administrative Code (Code) ([80 Ill. Adm. Code 250](#))] and for improving the programs of personnel administration of its constituent employers” ([80 Ill. Adm. Code §250.140\(c\)](#)).

This report communicates the final outcome of a comprehensive human resource operational audit, which included an on-site evaluation that was conducted March 28 through April 1, 2011.

#### **OVERVIEW**

The following Human Resource activities were reviewed and utilized in identifying the Material (Final Audit Report) and Non-Material Findings (Supplemental Report):

- **Assignment of Positions to Classes**  
The Auditor completes a review of selected job descriptions for timely updates, proper administration, and correct assignment of position classifications. Additional desk audits of selected positions are conducted onsite for appropriateness of position classifications. There is also an evaluation of the Employer’s position audit process and corresponding determinations.
- **Compensation Programs**  
The Auditor completes an analysis of the Employer’s use of pay rates and pay ranges, as approved by the Merit Board. An overall evaluation is then conducted of the Employer’s compensation program and initiatives to meet requirements of pay equity within the Employer’s market area.

- **Examination Program**  
The Auditor conducts a review of pre-employment testing operations. This includes test administration, admission procedures of applicants to examinations, license and certification verifications, scheduling, security, and register management.
- **Administration of Employment and Separation Procedures**  
The Auditor reviews the Employer's business processes and procedures related to the employment cycle, including pre-employment activities, probationary and status employment, and employment separation programs. There is also an assessment of the Employer's utilization and monitoring of non-status appointments.
- **Administration and Employment Protocols of Positions Exempt from Civil Service Guidelines**  
The Auditor completes a review of the employment protocols and assigned responsibilities for Principal Administrative Appointments. This review is conducted to assure compliance with recognized exemption authorization procedures. The Employer's exemption forms and related position descriptions are reviewed and selected incumbent interviews are conducted for validation of approved exemptions. The audit process also includes a review of the Employer's administrative procedures related to these appointments and their approved exemption status.
- **General Review of the Employer's Human Resource Program**  
The Auditor completes a general review of the Employer's human resource programs with respect to effectiveness, efficiency and levels of communication to constituencies. There is also an assessment of the recognition and interaction of human resource programs within the Employer's faculty, administrative and support staff employee groups. The impact of new technology on the recordkeeping and processing of information is also an element for review.
- **Other Follow-up Items from Previous Audit**  
Other follow-up items from previous audits, as well as other matters deemed necessary and appropriate, may have been reviewed and submitted as additional audit topics.

The following staff members from the System Office, Audit and Advisory Services Division, were directly responsible for conducting various aspects of the audit:

[Lucinda Neitzel, Audit and Advisory Services Manager](#)  
[Jeff Brownfield, Manager of Operations Division](#)  
[Paula Mitchell, Human Resource Assistant](#)

**Eastern Illinois University**  
**Final Audit Report**

**Executive Summary**  
**YEAR ENDED – FY 2011**

The compliance testing performed during this examination was conducted in accordance with State Universities Civil Service Act ([110 ILCS 70/36b et seq.](#)), Part 250 of the Illinois Administrative Code (Code) ([80 Ill. Adm. Code 250](#)), [State Universities Civil Service Procedures Manuals](#), applicable University/agency policies/procedures, and auditing standards.

**SUMMARY OF MATERIAL FINDINGS**

<b><u>Number of</u></b>	<b><u>This Report</u></b>
Findings	1
Repeated findings from previous audit®	1®

**SCHEDULE OF MATERIAL FINDINGS**

<b><u>Item Number</u></b>	<b><u>Page</u></b>	<b><u>Description</u></b>
EIU FY11-01	4	<b>FINDINGS (STATE UNIVERSITIES CIVIL SERVICE ACT)</b> Exemption Authorization Applied to Positions That Match Civil Service Classification Specifications®

**Eastern Illinois University**  
**Final Audit Report**

**Material Findings, Recommendations, Institutional Corrective Action Plan and  
Additional Auditor Comments**

**EIU FY11-01** Exemption Authorization Applied to Positions That Match Civil Service Classification Specifications

**Criteria/Standards (i.e., what should exist):**

- 1) [State Universities Civil Service Act \(Act\), Section 70/36\(e\)](#)
- 2) [Illinois Administrative Code \(Code\), Section 250.30\(a\) Coverage](#)
- 3) [Classification Procedures Manual, Section 2.2 Job Descriptions](#)
- 4) [Exemption Procedures Manual, Section 1.1 Overview](#)
- 5) [Exemption Procedures Manual, Section 6.3 System Office Review](#)
- 6) [Exemption Procedures Manual, Section 8.2 Changing an Exempt Position to a Civil Service Position](#)

These guidelines provide that all positions are Civil Service, except as categorically outlined. Exemptions are allowed in accordance with procedures, requiring either documented exemption approval from the System Office or verification of exemption authorization through the position descriptions when general titles are used. Accordingly, a periodic review and update of position descriptions are required to confirm that these exemption authorizations remain valid.

Periodic job description review and update procedures may indicate that a position originally identified as a Principal Administrative Appointment (PAA) may have incorrectly been classified or may have changed to the point whereby a department now must convert this position, and any employee currently occupying these positions, to an identified and appropriate Civil Service classification.

In this respect, biennial compliance audits of University System employers will include, but not be limited to:

- Comprehensive review of position descriptions
- Compliance with statutory and procedural criteria for exemptions
- Adequacy and thoroughness of related employment procedures
- Adequacy of internal review and approval processes
- Thoroughness and accuracy of quarterly reporting requirements
- Any other associated special interest items

When it has been determined and established that the job responsibilities and duties of a position do not meet the criteria for a PAA exemption under Section 36e(3), the Employer may be required to change the position from an exempt appointment to an appropriate Civil Service appointment in a recognized classification.

**Conditions/Facts (i.e., what actually exists):**

Through a review of approximately seventy-five (75) position descriptions, including on-site interviews with various exempted employees, it was determined that twenty (20) exempted positions listed in **Appendix A** were performing duties matching the specifications for various Civil Service classifications.

**Cause (i.e., why deficient condition occurred):**

According to the Employer, 'standard' titles approved for use by the System Office were applied to the majority of the exempted positions.

**Effect (i.e., impact of the problem):**

A failure to establish appropriate classification plan management protocols that properly update, analyze and evaluate position descriptions leads to unauthorized exemption authorizations, utilization of inappropriate employment protocols, and non-compliance with the Act, Code and Procedures. Consequently, positions are improperly identified and appropriate Civil Service protocols circumvented, significantly increasing the possibility of employment issues.

**Finding from Previous Audit:**

The Auditor identified nine (9) exempted positions that appeared to be performing duties and responsibilities comparable to those found in Civil Service classification(s) in the FY2009 compliance audit. *[Finding Code EIU FY09-01, pages 4-6].*

**Recommendation:**

In accordance with the statutory intent and basic premise contained in [Section 36\(e\)](#) of the Act and other related procedures, the assignment of positions to Civil Service classifications when the position description matches appropriate classification specifications must take precedence over the use of exemptions through utilizing general titles.

We recommend that the Employer complete an in-depth review of the position descriptions for the positions listed to further determine if they meet the specifications of the recommended Civil Service classifications. If it is determined that these positions match the specifications of the recommended Civil Service classifications, they should be transitioned to a Civil Service appointment as soon as possible. *It is strongly recommended that these positions be moved immediately, or at the next employment contract renewal date if applicable. Specifically, positions that are flagged as a result of Auditor recommendations discovered through the compliance audit process must be reviewed as a matter of standard protocol at the next contract renewal date.* We refer the Employer to the [Exemption Procedures Manual, Section](#)

[8.2, Changing an Exempt Position to a Civil Service Position](#) for guidance in transitioning these positions to appropriate Civil Service Appointments.

The Employer may also utilize the Pilot Program classification designations and transition the positions to be reviewed to one of these classifications if appropriate. These [Pilot Program](#) classifications utilize more flexible employment protocols and would offer a more transparent transition.

**Institutional Corrective Action Plan—provided by Linda Holloway, Interim Director of Human Resources**

When vacancies or new positions occur in the referenced Principal Administrative Appointment positions, they are reviewed for appropriate Civil Service classifications by the university's compensation manager. The compliance audit does not provide any reasons or guidelines as to why the twenty referenced positions should be reclassified as civil service and to our knowledge, no supervisors were interviewed to help determine the scopes of the employees' duties. In the absence of any such rationale, we believe that the initial reviews conducted to determine the position classifications are adequate. We are willing to provide copies of our records justifying the initial classifications. Further, as incumbents resign or retire and their positions are refilled, we will continue reviews of the positions to determine if Civil Service classifications are appropriate.

**Additional Auditor Comments:**

The State Universities Civil Service Act, Section 70/36e (110 ILCS 70/36e) specifically provides that the Merit Board has the authority to determine Principal Administrative Appointments (PAA) at each institute or agency. Specifically, it states that "the Director shall publish guidelines for such exemptions, as approved by the Merit Board."

We refer the Employer to these guidelines located in the [Exemption Procedures Manual, Section 3.1, Principal Administrative Appointments](#), approved by the Merit Board in June 2009. By definition, a PAA is "an employee who is charged with high level administrative responsibilities, whose decisions are based on administrative policies, and who exercises discretion and independent judgment. In addition, a PAA can be defined as an employee who is in a position requiring knowledge of an advanced type in a field of science or learning customarily acquired by a prolonged course of specialized intellectual instruction and study and which requires the consistent exercise of discretion and judgment, e.g., physician, attorney, engineer, architect."

The Exemption Procedures Manual further states, "As in any classification plan, there may be some overlap between current civil service classification specifications and the position standards under certain general PAA titles. ***It is important to remember that there was never***

*any intent to permit or condone the conversion of traditional civil service jobs to exempt status merely by virtue of the fact that the position duties and responsibilities may appear to correspond to the general function statement of any PAA title. The prominence of position duties and responsibilities must directly correspond to the position standards contained in the general PAA title used in order to validate the exemption.”*

Classification plan management protocols include base line standards for exemption authorization and evolve simply around one central concept, an evaluation of the position description. It is the responsibility of both the employee and supervisor to develop position descriptions that accurately reflect the scope, function, duties, and qualifications of any position, particularly if it is to be exempted from the Act. As previously stated, the assignment of positions to Civil Service classifications, when the position description matches appropriate classification specifications, is required to take precedence over the use of exemptions through utilizing general titles. Our audit process essentially matches the duties and responsibilities contained in the position description to the various specifications contained within the many civil service classifications, primarily those identified within the Professional, Semi-Professional, and Managerial occupational areas.

In our overall review of the position description documents submitted from the Employer, most of the duties contained in the current PAA position descriptions cited in **Appendix A** matched civil service classification specifications. For example, in two of the positions cited in **Appendix A**, Television Production/Directing Specialist (A01530) and Producer/Director (A08910), the function statements and description of duties contained in the position description were identical, with the exception of the title, and matched the specifications of the Television Writer –Producer and/or the Television Program/Operations Coordinator. Both positions had the same date of appointment; however, there was a fairly large gap in compensation between them. Many of the other position descriptions reviewed by the Auditor appeared vague and often did not include minimum educational or knowledge requirements. The triennial review of PAA position descriptions is an opportunity for Employers to continue to validate the exemption and better define positions if necessary to more precisely reflect the type of duties being performed by employees.

With respect to the positions cited in this finding, they all do appear to meet Civil Service criteria and simply do not contain the duties or level of authority and responsibility that would typically fall outside the specifications of standard professional or technical Civil Service classifications.

Many of the Civil Service classifications recommended by the Auditor as options for those PAA positions cited are not utilized by the Employer. It is also important to note that the failure to simply not use a specific classification structure at your employment location does not provide adequate justification for exemption. Improper exemptions from Civil Service regulations can lead to a fundamental breakdown of several interrelated human resource functions; including employment status, position classification, seniority, recruitment, compensation, performance,

and benefit administration. We invite the employer to submit any documentation that may further justify their decision to exempt the positions listed in **Appendix A**, most specifically that which demonstrates a comprehensive job analysis of position duties, as mapped to the civil service classification structure and which is required to truly validate these exemptions.

**State Universities Civil Service System  
Eastern Illinois University  
FY2011 Biennial Compliance Audit**

**Appendix A**

***Principal Administrative Appointments  
Position Descriptions Matching Civil Service Specifications***

Employee Name	Title	Appointment Date	Annual Salary	Position Number	Recommended Civil Service Classification
Barnard, Dana	Assistant Director of Student Life	7/1/2010	\$39,140.04	A08040	Program Director Series or Program Adviser
Black, Sandra	Assistant Director, Dining Services	7/1/2010	\$41,439.99	A08420	Food Service Management Series or Food Service Administrator Series
Casey, Lori	Specialist, Television Production/Directing	10/1/2010	\$54,902.09	A01530	Television Writer-Producer or Television Program/Operations Coordinator
Craig, Bethany	Coordinator of Program Development	7/1/2010	\$47,065.85	A06510	Adult Education Community Coordinator
Crask, Jonathan	Arts and Crafts Coordinator	8/19/2010	\$43,535.01	A02460	Assistant to Director of University Union
Feely, Cathy	Transfer Counselor	7/1/2010	\$36,024.00	A04680	Admissions and Records Series or Admissions/Records Specialist Series
Fisher, Rachel	Director of Student Community Service	7/1/2010	\$47,520.00	A98840	Community Affairs Specialist Series or Program Director Series
Hyde, Michelle	Director, Annual Fund and Commencement	11/8/2010	\$48,000.00	A08870	Special Events Facilitator or Development Officer
Karbassoon, Rameen	Producer/Director	10/1/2010	\$38,435.48	A08910	Television Writer-Producer or Television Program/Operations Coordinator
Litton, Sandra	Assistant Director (Technology)	7/1/2010	\$59,000.00	A08810	Information Technology Management Series, Applications Programmer Series, or Information Technology Manager/Administrative Coordinator
Marchuk, April	Foundation Executive Assistant	7/1/2010	\$38,036.04	A98920	Administrative Assistant Series, Administrative Aide, or Business/Administrative Associate
Messinger, Ryan	Assistant Director, Health Education & Promotion	7/1/2010	\$36,050.04	A99930	Health Education Coordinator
Muser, Jennifer	Assistant Director Civil Rights and Diversity	1/1/2011	\$19,560.78	A99600	Equal Opportunity Officer Series or Program Coordinator Series
Norman, Joshua	Technology Support Specialist	7/1/2010	\$46,350.00	A02340	Administrative Assistant Series or Information Technology Support Associate
Roa, Erica	Alcohol Standards Specialist	7/1/2010	\$36,000.00	A98740	Student Judicial Programs Series
Ross, Russel	Grant Project Director	10/1/2010	\$35,838.00	A99870	Grants and Contracts Administrator Series or Administrative Assistant Series
Ruybal, Michael	Financial Aid Counselor (Veterans Coordinator)	1/18/2011	\$40,000.00	A03520	Financial Aid Advisor Series
Sibley, Emily	Technology Support Specialist	7/1/2010	\$40,788.00	A02780	Institutional Research Data Specialist or Statistician Series
Watkins, Crystal	Corporate Fundraising Specialist	11/1/2010	\$41,004.00	A07300	Grants and Contracts Development Specialist
Wojtysiak, Christopher	Assistant Director of Panther Dining	7/1/2010	\$39,144.12	A08400	Food Service Management Series or Food Service Administrator Series