

STATE UNIVERSITIES CIVIL SERVICE SYSTEM

*Sunnycrest Center
1717 Philo Road, Suite 24
Urbana, Illinois 61802-6099*



*Joanne E. Maitland
Merit Board Chair
Lewis T. (Tom) Morelock
Executive Director*

September 13, 2012

Dr. Glenn Poshard
President
Southern Illinois University

Ms. Kimberly LaBonte
Executive Director of Internal Audits
Southern Illinois University

Dr. Julie A. Furst-Bowe
Chancellor
Southern Illinois University at Edwardsville

Mrs. Joanne E. Maitland
Merit Board Chair
State Universities Civil Service System

Mr. Kenneth Neher
Vice Chancellor for Administration
Southern Illinois University Edwardsville

Dr. Donna Manering
Merit Board Member
State Universities Civil Service System

Ms. Sherrie Senkfor
Director, Human Resources
Designated Employer Representative
Southern Illinois University Edwardsville

The State Universities Civil Service System respectfully submits the Final Audit Report of the Biennial Institutional Compliance Audit conducted at Southern Illinois University at Edwardsville. The audit period tested was December 1, 2009 through November 30, 2011. This report is intended to communicate the final material findings, recommendations and corresponding institutional responses formulated through a comprehensive human resource compliance and operational audit.

On behalf of the audit staff, we thank Southern Illinois University at Edwardsville and their human resource staff for a very productive audit experience. If there are any questions or a personal briefing on any item is desired, please call Lucinda M. Neitzel (217) 278-3150 ext. 239.

At this time, we would like to also ask for your questions, comments, or suggestions for improvement regarding the audit process by having your Human Resource audit contact person complete and return the attached Audit Process Survey. This Survey can also be found at the following website address: <http://www.sucss.illinois.gov/division.aspx?div=3&osm=c180>.

[REDACTED]
Lewis T. (Tom) Morelock
Executive Director

Southern Illinois University at Edwardsville Final Audit Report



State Universities Civil Service System Compliance Audit

September 13, 2012

Audit Period

December 1, 2009 to November 30, 2011

Prepared by:



Lucinda M. Neitzel
Audit and Advisory Services Manager

Southern Illinois University at Edwardsville
Final Audit Report

Table of Contents

Introduction 1

Executive Summary 4

Material Findings, Recommendations, Institutional Corrective Action Plans and Additional Auditor Comments 5

Appendices

- Appendix A: Principal Administrative Appointments Position Descriptions Matching Civil Service Classification Specifications

Southern Illinois University at Edwardsville **Final Audit Report**

Introduction

PURPOSE

The State Universities Civil Service System was created as a separate entity of the State of Illinois and is under the control of the University Civil Service Merit Board as set forth in Section 36b(3) of the State Universities Civil Service Act (Act) (110 ILCS 70/36b(3)). The purpose of the State Universities Civil Service System is to establish a sound program of personnel administration for its constituent employers (110 ILCS 70/36b(2)). To achieve this purpose, the Merit Board has been given a broad range of statutory powers and duties, which include the power to make rules to carry out the purpose of the State Universities Civil Service System and to appoint an Executive Director to administer the Act (110 ILCS 70/36d(11) and (12)).

As part of its statutory power, the Merit Board has promulgated rules that delegate to the Executive Director the authority and responsibility for conducting “ongoing audit programs of all Civil Service operations at all places of employment for the purpose of assuring compliance with the [Act (110 ILCS 70/36b et seq.)] and [Part 250 of the Illinois Administrative Code (Code) (80 Ill. Adm. Code 250)] and for improving the programs of personnel administration of its constituent employers” (80 Ill. Adm. Code §250.140(c)).

This report communicates the final outcome of a comprehensive human resource operational audit, which included an on-site evaluation that was conducted March 28-30, 2012. Upon submission of the Institutional Corrective Action Plan, a Final Audit Report (Material Findings only) is sent to the Employer, and if applicable, a Supplemental Report (Non-Material Findings) is sent to the campus/agency Human Resource Office for internal use.

OVERVIEW

The following Human Resource activities were reviewed and utilized in identifying the Material (Final Audit Report) Finding(s):

- **Assignment of Positions to Classes**
The Auditor completes a review of selected job descriptions for timely updates, proper administration, and correct assignment of position classifications. Additional desk audits of selected positions are conducted onsite for appropriateness of position classifications. There is also an evaluation of the Employer’s position audit process and corresponding determinations.

- **Compensation Programs**

The Auditor completes an analysis of the Employer's use of pay rates and pay ranges, as approved by the Merit Board. An overall evaluation is then conducted of the Employer's compensation program and initiatives to meet requirements of pay equity within the Employer's market area.

- **Examination Program**

The Auditor conducts a review of pre-employment testing operations. This includes test administration, admission procedures of applicants to examinations, license and certification verifications, scheduling, security, and register management.

- **Administration of Employment and Separation Procedures**

The Auditor reviews the Employer's business processes and procedures related to the employment cycle, including pre-employment activities, probationary and status employment, and employment separation programs. There is also an assessment of the Employer's utilization and monitoring of non-status appointments.

Administration and Employment Protocols of Positions Exempt from Civil Service Guidelines

The Auditor completes a review of the employment protocols and assigned responsibilities for Principal Administrative Appointments. This review is conducted to assure compliance with recognized exemption authorization procedures. The Employer's exemption forms and related position descriptions are reviewed and selected incumbent interviews are conducted for validation of approved exemptions. The audit process also includes a review of the Employer's administrative procedures related to these appointments and their approved exemption status.

- **General Review of the Employer's Human Resource Program**

The Auditor completes a general review of the Employer's human resource programs with respect to effectiveness, efficiency and levels of communication to constituencies. There is also an assessment of the recognition and interaction of human resource programs within the Employer's faculty, administrative and support staff employee groups. The impact of new technology on the recordkeeping and processing of information is also an element for review.

- **Other Follow-up Items from Previous Audit**

Other follow-up items from previous audits, as well as other matters deemed necessary and appropriate, may have been reviewed and submitted as additional audit topics.

The following staff members from the System Office, Audit and Advisory Services Division, were directly responsible for conducting various aspects of the audit:

Lucinda Neitzel, Audit and Advisory Services Manager
Jeff Brownfield, Manager of Operations Division
Marchant Martinelli, Human Resource Associate
Paula Mitchell, Human Resource Assistant

Southern Illinois University at Edwardsville
Final Audit Report

Executive Summary
YEAR ENDED -- FY2012

The compliance testing performed during this examination was conducted in accordance with State Universities Civil Service Act (110 ILCS 70/36b et seq.), Part 250 of the Illinois Administrative Code (Code) (80 Ill. Adm. Code 250), State Universities Civil Service Procedures Manuals, applicable University/agency policies/procedures, and auditing standards.

SUMMARY OF MATERIAL FINDINGS

<u>Number of</u>	<u>This Report</u>
Findings	1
Repeated findings from previous audit®	1®

SCHEDULE OF MATERIAL FINDINGS

<u>Item Number</u>	<u>Page</u>	<u>Description</u>
SIUE FY12-01	5	FINDINGS (STATE UNIVERSITIES CIVIL SERVICE ACT) Exemption Authorization Applied to Positions That Match Civil Service Classification Specifications

Southern Illinois University at Edwardsville
Final Audit Report

**Material Findings, Recommendations, Institutional Corrective Action Plan and
Additional Auditor Comments**

**SIUE FY12-01 Exemption Authorization Applied to Positions That Match Civil Service
Classification Specifications**

Criteria/Standards (i.e., what should exist):

- 1) State Universities Civil Service Act (Act), Section 70/36e Coverage
- 2) Illinois Administrative Code (Code), Section 250.30(a) Coverage
- 3) Exemption Procedures Manual, Section 1.1 Overview
- 4) Exemption Procedures Manual, Section 3.1 Principal Administrative Appointments
- 5) Exemption Procedures Manual, Section 6.3 System Office Review
- 6) Exemption Procedures Manual, Section 8.2 Changing an Exempt Position to a Civil Service Position

These guidelines provide that all positions are Civil Service, except as categorically outlined. Exemptions are allowed in accordance with procedures, requiring either documented exemption approval from the System Office or verification of exemption authorization through the position descriptions when general titles are used. Accordingly, a periodic review and update of position descriptions are required to confirm that these exemption authorizations remain valid.

Periodic job description review and update procedures may indicate that a position originally identified as a Principal Administrative Appointment (PAA) may have incorrectly been classified or may have changed to the point whereby a department now must convert this position, and any employee currently occupying these positions, to an identified and appropriate Civil Service classification.

In this respect, biennial compliance audits of University System employers will include, but not be limited to:

- Comprehensive review of position descriptions
- Compliance with statutory and procedural criteria for exemptions
- Adequacy and thoroughness of related employment procedures
- Adequacy of internal review and approval processes
- Thoroughness and accuracy of quarterly reporting requirements
- Any other associated special interest items

When it has been determined and established that the job responsibilities and duties of a position do not meet the criteria for a PAA exemption under Section 36e(3), the Employer may be required to change the position from an exempt appointment to an appropriate Civil Service appointment in a recognized classification.

Conditions/Facts (i.e., what actually exists):

Through a review of approximately one-hundred (100) position descriptions, including on-site interviews with various exempted employees, it was determined that nineteen (19) exempted positions listed in **Appendix A** were performing duties matching the specifications for various Civil Service classifications. The cited positions simply do not contain the duties or level of authority and responsibility that would typically fall outside the specifications of standard professional or technical Civil Service classifications.

It should be noted that through a preliminary analysis conducted on the position description sample, it was revealed that there were several other Civil Service exempt positions, not individually cited in **Appendix A** and primarily assigned to the Employer's Head Start program, that were performing duties that matched Civil Service classification specifications. Prior to issuing the draft audit report, the Auditor initiated actions to begin a job analysis and transition of these positions into the Civil Service classification plan. The Employer has committed to a comprehensive job analysis process and conversion of these positions. Therefore, these positions are not included or listed as part of this finding, based on this immediate attempt to resolve this issue.

Cause (i.e., why deficient condition occurred):

According to the Employer's payroll records, 'standard' titles approved for use by the System Office were applied to the majority of the exempted positions.

Effect (i.e., impact of the problem):

A failure to establish appropriate classification plan management protocols that properly update, analyze and evaluate position descriptions leads to unauthorized exemption authorizations, utilization of inappropriate employment protocols, and non-compliance with the Act, Code and Procedures. Consequently, positions are improperly identified and appropriate Civil Service protocols circumvented, significantly increasing the possibility of employment issues.

Finding from Previous Audit:

During the FY2010 compliance audit, through a review of approximately sixty (60) position descriptions, including on-site interviews with various exempted employees, it was determined that eight (8) exempt positions were performing duties matching the specifications for various Civil Service classifications. Additionally, during the FY2008 compliance audit, through a review of approximately forty (40) position descriptions, including on-site interviews of various exempted employees, it was determined that four (4) of the exempt positions were performing

duties matching the specifications for various Civil Service classifications. *[Finding Code SIUE FY10-01, pages 5-8 and Finding Code SIUE FY08-02, pages 6-8].*

Recommendation:

The Illinois Administrative Code, Section 250.30(a) specifically provides that the Merit Board has the authority to determine Principal Administrative Appointments (PAA) at each institution or agency. Specifically, it states that “The Director shall publish guidelines for such exemptions, as approved by the Merit Board.”

We refer the Employer to these guidelines located in the Exemption Procedures Manual, Section 3.1, Principal Administrative Appointments, approved by the Merit Board in June 2009. By definition, a PAA is “...an employee who is charged with high level administrative responsibilities, whose decisions are based on administrative policies, and who exercises discretion and independent judgment. In addition, a PAA can be defined as an employee who is in a position requiring knowledge of an advanced type in a field of science or learning customarily acquired by a prolonged course of specialized intellectual instruction and study...and which requires the consistent exercise of discretion and judgment, e.g., physician, attorney, engineer, architect.”

In accordance with the statutory intent and basic premise contained in these standards, the assignment of positions to Civil Service classifications when the position description matches appropriate classification specifications must take precedence over the use of exemptions through utilizing general titles. Improper exemptions from Civil Service regulations can lead to a fundamental breakdown of several interrelated human resource functions; including employment status, position classification, seniority, recruitment, compensation, performance, and benefit administration.

We recommend that the Employer complete an in-depth review of the position descriptions for the positions listed in **Appendix A** to further determine if they meet the specifications of the recommended Civil Service classifications. *Specifically, positions determined to be inappropriately exempted and flagged through the compliance audit process must be reviewed as a matter of standard protocol at the next contract renewal date.* If it is determined that these positions match the specifications of the recommended Civil Service classifications, they should be transitioned to a Civil Service appointment as soon as possible. It is strongly recommended that positions designated to be transitioned to Civil Service appointments be moved as soon as possible, preferably at the next employment contract renewal date, but certainly no later than at such time that these positions become vacant again. We refer the Employer to the Exemption Procedures Manual, Section 8.2, Changing an Exempt Position to a Civil Service Position for guidance in transitioning these positions to appropriate Civil Service Appointments. Please note that positions designated for transition through the audit process will be reviewed in the next biennial audit process and must be monitored by the Employer periodically.

As previously discussed with the Employer, the former Pilot Program classifications (Custom Classifications) have been incorporated into our standardized classification plan and are required to be utilized in accordance with standardized civil service protocols. These classifications provide a more flexible and transparent transition and may be appropriate for several of the positions cited in **Appendix A**. *Again, it is strongly recommended that these positions be moved immediately, or at the next employment contract renewal date if applicable.*

Note: *“Custom Classifications” refer to the former Pilot Program designations of Accounting Associate, Human Resource Associate, Business/Administrative Associate, Information Technology Manager/Administrative Coordinator, Information Technology Technical Associate, and Information Technology Support Associate.*

Institutional Corrective Action Plan—provided by Sherrie Senkfor, Director, Human Resources

The University agrees with the State Universities Civil Service System’s recommendation to conduct an in-depth review of each position cited in the biennial audit. The University clearly understands its obligation under the State Universities Civil System’s Statutes and Rules as it relates to properly classifying employees. The University will continue to make a concerted effort to reexamine the job duties and responsibilities when the positions listed in **Appendix A** become vacant in order to determine the proper classification.

**State Universities Civil Service System
Southern Illinois University at Edwardsville
FY2012 Biennial Compliance Audit**

Appendix A

***Principal Administrative Appointments
Position Descriptions Matching Civil Service Specifications***

Employee Name	Title	Annual Salary	Position Number(s)	Recommended Civil Service Classification
Blackledge, Walter L.	Director of Dental Database Administration	\$71,891.28	A99424	Information Technology Management Series, Information Technology Manager/Administrative Coordinator or Information Technology Technical Associate
Birke, Paula J.	Lead Financial Specialist	\$71,747.52	A99563	Financial Analyst/Planner Series or Business/Administrative Associate
Christensen, Emma L.	Assistant Director Financial Affairs	\$53,010.24	A99728	Business Manager II, Business/Administrative Associate, Accountant Series, Accounting Associate or Investment Analyst Series
Dusenberry, William D.	Computer/Video Instruction Specialist	\$46,885.20	A99264	Microcomputer Support Specialist Series, Information Technology Technical Associate or Information Technology Support Associate
Emmanuel, Ann M.	Specialist	\$53,008.32	A99764	Instructional Development Specialist
Ethridge, Melanie S.	Managing Editor	\$32,413.92	A99706	Publications Series
Graybill, Patience	Staff Assistant, Research Administration	\$44,606.64	A99671	Grants and Contracts Administrator Series or Program Coordinator Series
Hertz, Karen L.	Prospect Researcher	\$39,072.24	A99338	Clerk Series or Administrative Aide
Horton, Christy L.	Early Childhood Specialist/Administrative	\$41,071.20	A99721	Administrative Assistant Series, Accounting Series or Business/Administrative Associate
Kroenke, Danielle L.	Assistant Coordinator for Scheduling	\$32,869.92	A98980	Events Administrator Series or Special Events Facilitator
Munsey, Dawn C.	Assistant to the Dean	\$46,541.04	A99688	Administrative Assistant Series or Business Manager Series
Schieber, Tammy J.	Director, Business Affairs	\$62,823.60	A99442	Business Manager II, Business/Administrative Associate or Accounting Associate
Schneider, Loretta A.	Special Events/Catering Specialist	\$58,290.96	A99568	Catering Supervisor
Sears, Patrick	Enrollment Technical Support Specialist	\$45,028.32	A99323	Information Technology Management Series, Information Technology Technical Associate or Information Technical Support Associate
Shustrin, Kara L.	Program Specialist	\$45,658.56	A99249	Events Administrator Series, Special Events Facilitator or Program Coordinator Series
Thompson, Frederick K.	Coordinator, Facility Management & Assessment	\$41,774.40	A99836	Facilities Manager Series
Thorp, Angela D.	Director of Development - Education	\$66,504.00	A99665	Development Officer
Venditte, Jade C.	Director of Development - Pharmacy	\$66,504.00	A99409	Development Officer
Warner, Jason M.	Assistant Manager, Microsoft Servers/OS/SA	\$71,873.52	A99699	Information Technology Management Series, Network Specialist Series or Information Technology Technical Associate