

# STATE UNIVERSITIES CIVIL SERVICE SYSTEM

*Sunnycrest Center  
1717 Philo Road, Suite 24  
Urbana, Illinois 61802-6099*



*James D. Montgomery  
Merit Board Chair  
Lewis T. (Tom) Morelock  
Executive Director*

**FILE COPY**

April 10, 2014

Dr. Robert A. Easter  
President  
University of Illinois

Ms. Laura Alexander  
Senior Director of Human Resources  
University of Illinois at Springfield

Ms. Susan Koch  
Vice President and Chancellor  
University of Illinois at Springfield

Ms. Julie Zemaitis  
Executive Director-University Audits  
University of Illinois

Dr. Ed Wojcicki  
Associate Chancellor for Constituent  
Relations  
University of Illinois at Springfield

Mr. James D. Montgomery  
Merit Board Chair  
State Universities Civil Service System

Ms. Maureen Parks  
Associate Vice President for University  
Human Resources  
Designated Employer Representative  
University of Illinois

Ms. Karen Hasara  
Merit Board Member  
State Universities Civil Service System

Judge Patricia Brown Holmes  
Merit Board Member  
State Universities Civil Service System

The State Universities Civil Service System respectfully submits the Revised Final Audit Report of the Biennial Institutional Compliance Audit conducted at the University of Illinois at Springfield. The audit period tested was March 1, 2011 through February 28, 2013. This report is intended to communicate the final material findings, recommendations and corresponding institutional responses formulated through a comprehensive human resource compliance and operational audit. We appreciate the Employer's feedback in providing clarification of the data elements referenced in the previously submitted report dated February 18, 2014.

On behalf of the audit staff, we thank the University of Illinois at Springfield and their human resource staff for a very productive audit experience. If there are any questions or a personal briefing on any item is desired, please call Lucinda M. Neitzel (217) 278-3150 ext. 239.

[REDACTED]  
Lewis T. (Tom) Morelock  
Executive Director

---

---

# University of Illinois at Springfield Revised Final Audit Report

---



## State Universities Civil Service System Compliance Audit

April 10, 2014

Audit Period

March 1, 2011 to February 28, 2013

---

Prepared by:



Lucinda M. Neitzel  
Assistant Director, Operations and Audit Division

**University of Illinois at Springfield**  
**Revised Final Audit Report**

**Table of Contents**

**Introduction ..... 1**

**Executive Summary ..... 3**

**Material Findings, Recommendations, Institutional Corrective Action Plans, and Additional Auditor Comments..... 4**

**Appendices**

Appendix A: Principal Administrative Appointments Position Descriptions Matching Civil Service Specifications

**University of Illinois at Springfield**  
**Revised Final Audit Report**

**Introduction**

**PURPOSE**

The State Universities Civil Service System was created as a separate entity of the State of Illinois and is under the control of the University Civil Service Merit Board as set forth in Section 36b(3) of the State Universities Civil Service Act (Act) (110 ILCS 70/36b(3)). The purpose of the State Universities Civil Service System is to establish a sound program of personnel administration for its constituent employers (110 ILCS 70/36b(2)). To achieve this purpose, the Merit Board has been given a broad range of statutory powers and duties, which include the power to make rules to carry out the purpose of the State Universities Civil Service System and to appoint an Executive Director to administer the Act (110 ILCS 70/36d(11) and (12)).

As part of its statutory power, the Merit Board has promulgated rules that delegate to the Executive Director the authority and responsibility for conducting “ongoing audit programs of all Civil Service operations at all places of employment for the purpose of assuring compliance with the [Act (110 ILCS 70/36b et seq.)] and [Part 250 of the Illinois Administrative Code (Code) (80 Ill. Adm. Code 250)] and for improving the programs of personnel administration of its constituent employers” (80 Ill. Adm. Code §250.140(c)).

This report communicates the final outcome of a comprehensive human resource operational audit, which included an on-site evaluation that was conducted July 10-12, 2013.

**OVERVIEW**

The following Human Resource activities were reviewed and utilized in identifying the Material (Final Audit Report) and Non-material Findings (Supplemental Report):

- **Assignment of Positions to Classes**  
The Auditor completes a review of selected job descriptions for timely updates, proper administration, and correct assignment of position classifications. Additional desk audits of selected positions are conducted onsite for appropriateness of position classifications. There is also an evaluation of the Employer’s position audit process and corresponding determinations.
- **Compensation Programs**  
The Auditor completes an analysis of the Employer’s use of pay rates and pay ranges, as approved by the Merit Board. An overall evaluation is then conducted of the Employer’s compensation program and initiatives to meet requirements of pay equity within the Employer’s market area.

- **Examination Program**  
The Auditor conducts a review of pre-employment testing operations. This includes test administration, admission procedures of applicants to examinations, license and certification verifications, scheduling, security, and register management.
- **Administration of Employment and Separation Procedures**  
The Auditor reviews the Employer's business processes and procedures related to the employment cycle, including pre-employment activities, probationary and status employment, and employment separation programs. There is also an assessment of the Employer's utilization and monitoring of non-status appointments.
- **Administration and Employment Protocols of Positions Exempt from Civil Service Guidelines**  
The Auditor completes a review of the employment protocols and assigned responsibilities for Principal Administrative Appointments. This review is conducted to assure compliance with recognized exemption authorization procedures. The Employer's exemption forms and related position descriptions are reviewed and selected incumbent interviews are conducted for validation of approved exemptions. The audit process also includes a review of the Employer's administrative procedures related to these appointments and their approved exemption status.
- **General Review of the Employer's Human Resource Program**  
The Auditor completes a general review of the Employer's human resource programs with respect to effectiveness, efficiency and levels of communication to constituencies. There is also an assessment of the recognition and interaction of human resource programs within the Employer's faculty, administrative and support staff employee groups. The impact of new technology on the recordkeeping and processing of information is also an element for review.
- **Other Follow-up Items from Previous Audit**  
Other follow-up items from previous audits, as well as other matters deemed necessary and appropriate, may have been reviewed and submitted as additional audit topics.

The following staff members from the System Office, Operations and Audit Division, were directly responsible for conducting various aspects of the audit:

[Lucinda Neitzel, Assistant Director, Operations and Audit Division](#)  
[Danielle Routh, Program Coordinator, Operations and Audit Division](#)

**University of Illinois at Springfield**  
**Revised Final Audit Report**

**Executive Summary**  
**YEAR ENDED – FY2014**

The compliance testing performed during this examination was conducted in accordance with State Universities Civil Service Act (110 ILCS 70/36b et seq.), Part 250 of the Illinois Administrative Code (Code) (80 Ill. Adm. Code 250), State Universities Civil Service Procedures Manuals, applicable University/agency policies/procedures, and auditing standards.

**SUMMARY OF MATERIAL FINDINGS**

| <b><u>Number of</u></b>                | <b><u>This Report</u></b> |
|--|---------------------------|
| Findings                               | 1                         |
| Repeated findings from previous audit® | 1®                        |

**SCHEDULE OF MATERIAL FINDINGS**

| <b><u>Item Number</u></b> | <b><u>Page</u></b> | <b><u>Description</u></b>  |
|---------------------------|--------------------|--|
| UIS FY14-01               | 4                  | <b>FINDINGS (STATE UNIVERSITIES CIVIL SERVICE ACT)</b><br>Exemption Authorization Applied to Positions That Match Civil Service Classification Specifications® |

**University of Illinois at Springfield**  
**Revised Final Audit Report**

**Material Findings, Recommendations, Institutional Corrective Action Plan, and**  
**Additional Auditor Comments**

**UIS FY14-01**      Exemption Authorization Applied to Positions That Match Civil Service Classification Specifications

**Criteria/Standards (i.e., what should exist):**

- 1) *State Universities Civil Service Act (Act), Section 70/36e Coverage*
- 2) *Illinois Administrative Code (Code), Section 250.30(a) Coverage*
- 3) *Exemption Procedures Manual, Section 1.1 Overview*
- 4) *Exemption Procedures Manual, Section 3.1 Principal Administrative Appointments*
- 5) *Exemption Procedures Manual, Section 6.3 System Office Review*
- 6) *Exemption Procedures Manual, Section 8.2 Changing an Exempt Position to a Civil Service Position*

These guidelines provide that all positions are Civil Service, except as categorically outlined. Exemptions are allowed in accordance with procedures, requiring either documented exemption approval from the System Office or verification of exemption authorization through the position descriptions when general titles are used. Accordingly, a periodic review and update of position descriptions are required to confirm that these exemption authorizations remain valid.

Periodic job description review and update procedures may indicate that a position originally identified as a Principal Administrative Appointment (PAA) may have incorrectly been classified or may have changed to the point whereby a department now must convert this position, and any employee currently occupying these positions, to an identified and appropriate Civil Service classification.

In this respect, biennial compliance audits of University System employers will include, but not limited to:

- Comprehensive review of position descriptions
- Compliance with statutory and procedural criteria for exemptions
- Adequacy and thoroughness of related employment procedures
- Adequacy of internal review and approval processes
- Thoroughness and accuracy of quarterly reporting requirements
- Any other associated special interest items

When it has been determined and established that the job responsibilities and duties of a position do not meet the criteria for a PAA exemption under Section 36e(3) of the Act, the Employer may be required to change the position from an exempt appointment to an appropriate Civil Service appointment in a recognized classification.

**Conditions/Facts (i.e., what actually exists):**

As a result of the FY2012 Biennial Compliance Audit, the Employer engaged in a comprehensive review of the thirty-nine (39) positions whose job descriptions were identified as being consistent with Civil Service classification specifications. As outlined in their Institutional Corrective Action Plan (ICAP), the Employer implemented new position analysis protocols in February 2012 utilizing the Gauge© Job Analysis Evaluation Software by Pilat of North America, Inc., consistent with contractual arrangements already in place at the University of Illinois at Chicago. While conducting the current FY2014 Biennial Compliance Audit, the Employer provided a detailed summary report with respect to the positions cited during the previous FY2012 audit.

As a result of this comprehensive analysis, the Employer determined that twenty-eight (28) exempted positions cited during the previous FY2012 Biennial Compliance Audit appeared to overlap with certain Civil Service classification specifications. The Employer indicated that while all positions are reviewed prior to a unit seeking to fill a vacancy, based on the job analysis outcomes, these positions were to be identified for additional comprehensive review at the time an encumbered position becomes vacant. Further, the Employer indicated that six (6) of the previously cited position findings became vacant and were subsequently converted to an appropriate Civil Service Classification Specification.

Consistent with standard audit protocols, the Auditor selected a sample of exempt positions for review during this current FY2014 Biennial Compliance Audit period. Through a review of approximately seventy-seven (77) exempt position descriptions, including on-site interviews with various exempted employees, it was determined that twenty-one (21) exempted positions listed in **Appendix A** were performing duties matching the specifications for various Civil Service classifications. Three (3) of these twenty-one (21) positions cited in this finding had also been cited in previous audits. Overall, the positions cited in this finding appear to contain the duties and/or level of authority and responsibility that would typically fall within the specifications of standard professional or technical Civil Service classifications.

**Cause (i.e., why deficient condition occurred):**

According to the Employer's payroll documents, 'standard' titles approved for use by the System Office were applied to the majority of the exempted positions.

**Effect (i.e., impact of the problem):**

Improper exemptions from Civil Service regulations can lead to a fundamental breakdown of several interrelated human resource functions; including employment status, position classification, seniority, recruitment, compensation, performance, and benefit administration.

While position descriptions have been properly documented and developed, it appears that business processes to manage exemptions are inaccurate in some instances.

**Finding from Previous Audit:**

During the FY2012 Biennial Compliance Audit, the Auditor identified thirty-nine (39) exempted positions that appeared to be performing duties and responsibilities comparable to those found in Civil Service classifications. *[Finding Code UIS FY12-01, pages 5-7].*

**Recommendation:**

Based on information provided by the Employer, the new position analysis protocols implemented utilizing the Gauge© Job Analysis Evaluation Software by Pilat of North America, Inc. appear to have made a positive impact in assisting the Employer with evaluating positions for proper classification, employment designation, and exemption. However, in order to properly regulate and manage these appointments, we request that the Human Resource Office continue to utilize this job analysis platform and routinely review all exempt position descriptions and future vacancies in accordance with the Exemption Procedures Manual. Utilizing this job analysis platform, the Employer should be able to properly identify those positions that truly should be a Civil Service appointment of some type and those positions that truly meet exemption authorization standards, either as a Principal Administrative Appointment or as a Teaching, Research, or Extension Faculty Appointment.

The Employer is reminded that the Illinois Administrative Code, Section 250.30(a) specifically, provides that the Merit Board has the authority to determine Principal Administrative Appointments (PAA) at each institution or agency. Specifically, it states that “The Director shall publish guidelines for such exemptions, as approved by the Merit Board.” We refer the Employer to these guidelines located in the Exemption Procedures Manual, Section 3.1, Principal Administrative Appointments and Section 4.1, Teaching, Research, and Extension Faculty Appointments, approved by the Merit Board in June 2009. In accordance with the statutory intent and basic premise contained in these standards, the assignment of positions to Civil Service classifications when the position description matches appropriate classification specifications must take precedence over the use of exemptions through utilizing general titles. Improper exemptions from Civil Service regulations can lead to a fundamental breakdown of several interrelated human resource functions; including employment status, position classification, seniority, recruitment, compensation, performance, and benefit administration.

The Auditor further recommends that the Employer complete an in-depth review of the position descriptions for the positions listed in **Appendix A** to determine if they also meet the specifications of the recommended Civil Service classifications. ***Specifically, positions determined to be inappropriately exempted and flagged through the compliance audit process must be reviewed as a matter of standard protocol at the next contract renewal date.*** If it is determined that these positions match the specifications of the recommended Civil Service classifications, they should be transitioned to a Civil Service appointment as soon as possible. It is strongly recommended that positions designated to be transitioned to Civil

Service appointments be moved as soon as possible, preferably at the next employment contract renewal date, but certainly no later than at such time that these positions become vacant again. We refer the Employer to the Exemption Procedures Manual, Section 8.2, Changing an Exempt Position to a Civil Service Position for guidance in transitioning these positions to appropriate Civil Service Appointments. ***Again, please note that positions designated for transition through the audit process will be reviewed in the next biennial audit process and must be monitored by the Employer periodically.***

**Institutional Corrective Action Plan—provided by Laura Alexander, Senior Director of Human Resources**

The University of Illinois at Springfield has received, and understands the Auditors' finding (although we can neither agree nor disagree with it at this time) and we agree to conduct a comprehensive review of the 18 UIS positions that were cited in the audit process. Three (3) of these positions are UA positions [REDACTED] and the campus HR Office does not review or maintain any exemption authority over UA positions. These positions fall under the Assistant Vice President for Human Resources, UA Employee Relations and HR. In addition, three (3) of the positions had been previously identified in prior audits [REDACTED] [REDACTED] as more appropriate as civil service (and, consistent with the audit recommendations, were flagged for another comprehensive review/conversion upon vacancy). Upon conclusion of the review, if the positions are determined to be appropriate classified as civil service they will be added to the list of PAA positions that have been previously identified for conversion no later than when the position becomes vacant and we will go through a second comprehensive review if it is not converted until the incumbent resigns.

It should also be noted that the list is revisited when we receive requests for new/replacement positions to determine whether the position in question had been previously been written up as an audit finding, and the list is updated as positions are reviewed/converted.

**Additional Auditor Comments:**

With respect to the three (3) positions cited during the current audit as being assigned to University Administration (UA), the Employer has indicated that they do not review, maintain or directly manage these positions, so they have no obligation to insure compliance standards and exemption protocols are met. While these positions are approved and administered through a different University office and not the UIS Human Resource Office, it is still the Employer's responsibility to insure that proper exemption protocols are followed. The Employer, UIS in this instance, retains their legal obligation under the State Universities Civil Service Act regardless of the budget line authority for the position.

The Auditor conducted a secondary review of past and present audit records, as well as related position descriptions for the three (3) positions [REDACTED] referenced in the Employer's Institutional Corrective Action Plan (ICAP). These incumbents have remained in

their positions since their initial employment some time ago and were previously cited in earlier audits. These positions were again sampled during the current FY2014 Biennial Compliance Audit and the updated and most current job descriptions were still found to directly correspond to Civil Service classification specifications.

**State Universities Civil Service System  
University of Illinois at Springfield  
FY2014 Biennial Compliance Audit**

**Appendix A**

***Principal Administrative Appointments  
Position Descriptions Matching Civil Service Classification Specifications***

| Employee Name | Title  | Date of Employment | Date of Appointment in Position | Position Number | Annual Salary | Recommended Civil Service Classification Options                                  |
|---------------|--|--------------------|---------------------------------|-----------------|---------------|---|
| ██████████    | Academic Technology Services Specialist  | 6/1/1998           | 1/18/2004                       | S98624          | \$50,050.00   | Information Technology Technical Associate  |
| ██████████    | Director, Office of Graduate Intern Programs                                   | 9/1/2011           | 9/1/2011                        | S98677          | \$58,140.00   | Program Coordinator Series  |
| ██████████    | Assistant To the Associate Vice Chancellor for Graduate Education and Research | 10/27/2008         | 1/16/2010                       | S95385          | \$54,631.00   | Administrative Assistant or Administrative Aide                                   |
| ██████████    | Director of Volunteer and Civic Engagement Center                              | 11/28/2011         | 11/28/2011                      | SA97954         | \$53,040.00   | Program Coordinator Series  |
| ██████████    | Alumni Relations Officer   | 8/13/2012          | 8/13/2012                       | SA1475          | \$41,500.00   | Assistant Director of Alumni Relations  |
| ██████████    | Enterprise Systems Specialist  | 2/21/2005          | 11/24/2008                      | S98994          | \$58,000.00   | Information Technology Technical Associate  |
| ██████████    | Enterprise-Wide Auditor  | 7/10/2006          | 7/10/2006                       | S22073          | \$71,388.04   | Internal Auditor Manager  |
| ██████████    | Assistant Director of Enterprise Applications                                  | 12/3/2012          | 12/3/2012                       | SA1362          | \$65,000.00   | Information Technology Manager/Administrative Coordinator                         |
| ██████████    | Assistant to the Dean  | 3/18/2002          | 8/20/2007                       | S99718          | \$48,480.00   | Administrative Assistant or Business/Administrative Associate                     |
| ██████████    | Assistant Director of Housing--Residential Facilities and Operations           | 7/6/2010           | 7/6/2010                        | S93617          | \$59,122.00   | Housing Administrator III   |
| ██████████    | Broadcast Operations Research Specialist                                       | 2/1/2000           | 2/1/2000                        | S98759          | \$36,031.00   | Radio/Television Producer/Announcer Series or Radio Station Production Supervisor |
| ██████████    | Network Analyst  | 5/1/1995           | 12/16/1998                      | S99789          | \$65,616.00   | Information Technology Technical Associate  |
| ██████████    | Director of Facilities Scheduling and Services                                 | 9/24/1990          | 3/16/2008                       | S93969          | \$52,932.00   | Public Function Supervisor  |
| ██████████    | Development Data Specialist  | 6/4/2007           | 6/4/2007                        | S95892          | \$48,859.00   | Information Technology Technical Associate  |
| ██████████    | Assistant Director of Athletics for Compliance and Student Services            | 8/29/2011          | 8/29/2011                       | S95519          | \$45,150.00   | Internal Auditor Series   |
| ██████████    | Academic Technology Services Specialist  | 5/1/2001           | 5/1/2001                        | S99932          | \$68,105.00   | Information Technology Technical Associate  |
| ██████████    | Assistant to the Dean  | 4/27/1987          | 10/1/2001                       | S99699          | \$57,121.00   | Administrative Assistant or Business/Administrative Associate                     |
| ██████████    | WUIS Program Director  | 2/16/1998          | 2/16/1998                       | S99341          | \$37,591.00   | Radio/Television Producer/Announcer Series or Radio Station Production Supervisor |
| ██████████    | Director of Recreational Sports  | 6/18/2007          | 6/18/2007                       | S95962          | \$64,296.00   | Intramural and Recreation Coordinator   |
| ██████████    | Assistant Director of Network Services   | 1/28/2013          | 1/28/2013                       | S99453          | \$70,000.00   | Information Technology Manager/Administrative Coordinator                         |
| ██████████    | MTL Online Coordinator   | 10/1/2011          | 10/1/2011                       | SA1136          | \$36,720.00   | Program/Student Advisor   |